

**HISTORIC PRESERVATION ADVISORY BOARD
MEETING
NOVEMBER 17, 2011**

MEMBERS PRESENT: John Chalifoux, Chairman
Cynthia Beauford-Johnson, Gordon Bower, Bill Cote,
Nancy Lisby, Karen Lyons, Jan Sidebottom

OTHERS PRESENT: Mitchell Austin, Urban Design Planner
Teri Tubbs, Zoning Official
Garrett Kizer, Alberta Gerck, Katherine Ariens

CALL TO ORDER/ANNOUNCEMENTS

- A. Roll Call
 - Mr. Chalifoux noted Mr. Teddy Shively, Alternate Board Member, was in attendance.
- B. Next Scheduled Meeting
 - 1. December 22, 2011
 - Mr. Chalifoux recalled the Board's December 2011 meeting had been rescheduled to the third Thursday, December 15, 2011, requesting clarification of same.
 - Recording Secretary Kelly apologized that change had not been made, asking if members would be available on December 22, 2011. She explained there was a conflict with another board/committee meeting on December 15, 2011.
 - Mr. Chalifoux confirmed a quorum of members, at the very least, would be available on December 22, 2011.
 - 2. December 14, 2011 – Joint City & County Historic Meeting

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

- A. Meeting of October 27, 2011
 - Mr. Chalifoux noted a correction to page 4.
 - Mr. Cote MOVED, Ms. Lisby SECONDED approval of the October 27, 2011 minutes as amended. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- B. September 14, 2011 – Joint City & County Historic Meeting

Note: Citizens Comments were heard following Approval of Minutes.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

- Recording Secretary Kelly swore in all participants.
- A. V-03-11 – Request for a variance to the Land Development Regulations (LDRs) pursuant to Chapter 26, Section 26-16.10, Punta Gorda Code, to allow a new 2-car garage addition to be constructed and attached to the historic structure addressed as 413 West Retta Esplanade with a street yard setback on the Durrance Street side of the property of 4.1 feet instead of 10 feet as is required per Chapter 26, Section 26-

3.7(g)(2), Punta Gorda Code. Said property is located within the Neighborhood Residential-10 Units per Acre (NR-10) zoning district in the National Register Historic District (NRHD).

Legal: A part of Lot H and all of Lot B, measuring 73 feet by 140 feet in the northwesterly corner of the East 1/2 of Block 8, a Subdivision of Block 8, City of Punta Gorda, recorded in Plat Book 1, Page 34, of the Public Records of Charlotte County, Florida; and that portion of an alley described in that deed dated March 5, 1986, recorded in Official Records Book 859, Page 1673, of the Public Records of Charlotte County, Florida (a/k/a 413 West Retta Esplanade, Punta Gorda, Florida).

- Mr. Mitchell Austin, Urban Design Planner, read the staff report, as delineated in the agenda material, into the record, providing a detailed review of the criteria which must be met in order for a variance to be approved. He recommended approval of V-03-01, offering to answer any questions regarding same.
- Ms. Lyons clarified the applicant wished to construct the garage where the carport had been located prior to being destroyed by Hurricane Charley in August 2004.
- Ms. Lisby confirmed this home was previously owned by Mr. Paul Sullivan, stating she recalled a garage had been in place sometime in the past.
- Mr. Austin responded there had not been a garage but rather only a carport.
- Ms. Lyons commented there was very little room on the site, particularly in light of the existing pool.
- Mr. Garrett Kizer, applicant's representative, offered to answer any questions relative to the request.
- Mr. Chalifoux noted the subject home had been vacant since August 2004, asking if the owner intended to renovate the structure's interior.
- Mr. Kizer replied affirmatively, stating Mr. Michael Knapp, applicant/owner, planned to renovate both the interior and exterior of the home; however, the renovation was contingent upon approval of this variance application. He mentioned the owner planned to expend roughly \$160,000 on renovation of the entire property.
- Mr. Chalifoux confirmed sufficient room existed on the property for the garage, which would need to be attached to the home. He advised he had no objection to the plans as presented.
- Ms. Lisby questioned the plan for the front exterior of the garage.
- Mr. Austin displayed a rendering of same, confirming an example was provided in the agenda material.
- Mr. Kizer explained the garage would be constructed with Hardie Board siding to match the home.

- Ms. Lisby asked if the roof line of the garage would be consistent with that of the house.
- Mr. Kizer replied the former would have less of a slope than the latter; however, the materials would be the same. He clarified the existing metal roof would be matched as closely as possible.
- Mr. Chalifoux requested clarification of the size of the Hardie Board siding.
- Mr. Kizer pointed out the front porch had retained the original siding, noting same was a wider product; thus, the owner intended to utilize a 7 ¼ foot product for the garage and the home.
- Ms. Lyons commented favorably on the overall proposal.
- Mr. Austin acknowledged the site was large enough to construct the garage elsewhere on the property; however, due to the configuration of the wrap-around porch, location of the garage on that side of the property could detrimentally impact the architectural and historic character of the home.
- Mr. Chalifoux called three times for anyone to speak on V-03-01.
- Mr. Cote MOVED, Ms. Sidebottom SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- Ms. Lisby MOVED, Ms. Lyons SECONDED to find V-03-11 consistent with the Comprehensive Plan and to recommend approval of same based upon the evidence and testimony presented. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.

NEW BUSINESS

- A. CA-35-11 – 413 West Retta Esplanade
 - Mr. Austin announced this agenda item was the Certificate of Appropriateness for the property described above in V-03-11. He recommended approval of CA-35-11 contingent upon City Council’s approval of the above mentioned variance application.
 - Mr. Chalifoux called three times for anyone to speak on CA-35-11.
 - Mr. Cote MOVED, Ms. Lyons SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Ms. Lisby MOVED, Ms. Lyons SECONDED approval of CA-35-11 contingent upon City Council’s approval of V-03-11. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- B. CA-37-11 – 133 West Marion Avenue
 - Mr. Austin announced this request was for proposed signage for Global NavSource, a business located on the subject property. He stated the structure was constructed circa 1912 for commercial use in a Classical Revival architectural style, adding the structure was individually listed on the National Register of Historic Places. He confirmed the zoning designation of City Center (CC) allowed office as a permitted use.

He explained the proposed signage consisted of a window sign on the transom window above the main entry doors facing West Marion Avenue, noting the sign was in compliance with City Code. He recommended approval of CA-37-11 as the proposed signage did not adversely impact the architectural or historic character of the structure nor the Downtown Commercial Historic District (DCHD).

- Ms. Katherine Ariens, applicant, offered to answer any questions.
 - Mr. Chalifoux confirmed members had no questions or concerns. He then called three times for anyone to speak on CA-37-11.
 - Mr. Cote MOVED, Ms. Lyons SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Ms. Lyons MOVED, Mr. Bower SECONDED approval of CA-37-11. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- C. CA-38-11 – 105 West Marion Avenue
- Mr. Austin announced this was an application for proposed signage for Carrie’s Interiors. He stated this commercial structure was built in 1952, adding the property was located in the CC zoning district. He explained the proposed signage consisted of window lettering and replacement of same on an existing directory sign facing West Marion Avenue, all of which complied with City Code. He recommended approval of CA-38-11 as the proposed signage did not adversely impact the architectural or historic character of the structure nor the DCHD.
 - Mr. Chalifoux called three times for anyone to speak on CA-38-11.
 - Mr. Cote MOVED, Ms. Sidebottom SECONDED to close the public hearing. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
 - Ms. Sidebottom MOVED, Ms. Lyons SECONDED approval of CA-38-11. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY.
- D. CA-36-11 – 227 Harvey Street (information only)
- Mr. Austin announced the applicant proposed replacement of an existing fence to the rear of the subject property. He stated this single family home was constructed circa 1925 and was listed as a non-contributing structure within the NRHD. He mentioned the existing fence had been damaged by a fallen tree. He concluded staff had approved CA-36-11 administratively as there was no adverse impact on the structure’s character or zoning district.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

- A. Florida Master Site File Survey
- Mr. Austin confirmed members had been provided with a list of all structures within City limits constructed prior to 1966 in their agenda packets. He explained the

properties which would be surveyed throughout 2012 would be a subset of this list, adding properties surveyed in the 2002 to 2003 Historic Resources Survey would not be re-surveyed as part of the initial effort. He concluded no action was required from the Board but rather same was being presented for information only.

- Mr. Bower questioned the size of the above mentioned subset.
- Mr. Austin replied slightly over half.
- Mr. Chalifoux recalled he had requested the survey questionnaire be included in this agenda packet.
- Mr. Austin apologized for neglecting to do so, stating he would provide same in the next agenda packet.
- Ms. Lisby mentioned she and Ms. Lyons had volunteered to survey Palm Avenue and Gill Street, adding she felt sure she could recruit others. She expressed hope this community effort would alleviate at least some of staff's burden.
- Discussion ensued with regard to the various types of information to be gathered as part of the survey.

B. Fund Raising Account Balance

- Mr. Chalifoux announced the account balance had increased to \$320, expressing appreciation to all donors. He then stated he had issued a letter to Main Street Punta Gorda (MSPG), at this Board's direction, requesting funding through MSPG's incentive program, questioning the result of same.
- Ms. Sidebottom replied all funds had been exhausted.
- Ms. Lyons displayed the Board's "Historic Preservation Fund" brochure, stating she believed they should be displayed more prevalently.
- Mr. Chalifoux agreed; however, the cost for additional printing would be paid out of the subject account.

C. Historical Award Program

- Ms. Lyons confirmed members had reviewed the Annual Award Application form provided in their agenda packets.
- Mr. Chalifoux confirmed Mr. Bower had received the photograph of a sample plaque. He recalled Ms. Sidebottom had suggested retaining a local business for the plaque, confirming he was very much in favor of working with a local vendor contingent upon the cost associated with same.
- Mr. Bower suggested such a vendor may be amenable to a reduced fee if their business name could be depicted in small print toward the bottom of the plaque.
- Mr. Chalifoux expressed concern with regard to the appropriateness of same.

- Consensus of the Board was opposition to allowing delineation of the business name on the plaque face.
- Mr. Chalifoux then displayed a photograph of a sample plaque, noting same could be provided at a cost of \$319, including shipping.
- Ms. Lyons asked if Mr. Chalifoux had provided Mr. Gene Murtha, Alternate Board Member, with a copy of the above mentioned plaque.
- Mr. Chalifoux replied he had not.
- Ms. Sidebottom offered to obtain a quote from another business located in Charlotte County.
- Discussion then ensued with regard to application deadlines.
- Consensus to move forward with the Award Program; Mr. Bower to write an article requesting applications no later than January 31, 2012, with mention of the need for funding as well; only 1 award to be presented in the Program's first year; awards to be presented by City Council.
- Mr. Chalifoux asked Ms. Sidebottom to provide the pricing information, as discussed earlier, at the Board's next meeting.

D. Historical Society Update

- Ms. Lisby stated on November 22, 2011, and the following Tuesdays and Thursdays until the week prior to Christmas, middle school students from Port Charlotte would be entertained at the Train Depot. She mentioned the History Park Christmas Extravaganza would be held from December 2-10, 2011.

E. Punta Gorda History Center Update

- Mr. Chalifoux announced the first board meeting was held a few days earlier at which a discussion was held relative to development of a strategic plan, adding seed money was also being sought. He noted the board was currently considering a few sites, the first being the old Courthouse, acknowledging the challenges associated with same. He mentioned consideration was also being given to the parcel adjacent to the History Park, specifically the site of the former City warehouse.

STAFF COMMENTS

A. City of Punta Gorda Comprehensive Plan – Historic Element

- Mr. Austin announced the first draft of the Goals, Objectives and Policies (GOPs) was being developed.

COMMITTEE/BOARD COMMENTS

- Mr. Chalifoux stated he attended the most recent meeting of the Charlotte County Historical Advisory Committee (HAC) upon their invitation. He reminded members of an earlier discussion relative to development of a joint letter to the Board of Charlotte

County Commissioners (BCCC) seeking funding for the Placida Bunk House stabilization project, confirming BCCC awarded \$30,000 for same. He noted that project would be the main topic at the upcoming joint meeting, urging members to ensure their attendance due to the importance of that structure. He then announced an upcoming event at the Port Charlotte Beach Complex on Friday, February 17, 2012, at which all historic factions would be brought together, asking members to be sure to attend. He then confirmed Ms. Lyons and Ms. Lisby were working on fund raising.

Note: Citizens Comments were heard following Approval of Minutes.

CITIZENS COMMENTS

- Ms. Alberta Gerk advised she had purchased 415 Carmalita Street several years earlier, stating she had recently received a notice from the Code Compliance Division relative to the condition of the property. She mentioned her spouse had passed away in January 2011. She announced the repairs necessary to bring the property into compliance were extensive, adding the home's historical significance exacerbated the situation. She explained she simply did not have the necessary financial resources; thus, she simply wished to divest herself of the property, suggesting a purchase price of the appraised value as listed by the Charlotte County Property Appraiser's (CCPA) office.
- Ms. Lisby asked if Ms. Gerk had purchased the property from Mr. Daryl Moore.
- Ms. Gerk replied she had not but rather had purchased same from Mr. Stephen LeBlanc. She mentioned the purchase was made when property values were at their peak.
- Mr. Austin interjected the subject home was listed on the FMSF, which indicated it was constructed circa 1927. He explained the home was essentially in two pieces, i.e., the original structure and an addition, displaying photographs of same. He provided a brief review of the home's construction type and size, maintaining despite the poor condition at this time, there was much historic value from an architectural standpoint.
- Mr. Chalifoux asked what staff and Ms. Gerk were seeking from the Board.
- Mr. Austin expressed hope the structure could be saved and demolition avoided.
- Mr. Bower asked if the property was listed for sale.
- Mr. Austin replied in the negative; however, he opined same would be considered. He pointed out there were a significant number of distressed properties on the market at this time, adding potential buyers may not see the structure's historical significance.
- Mr. Chalifoux asked if the structure was located in the Trabue Woods historic district.
- Mr. Austin replied it was not; thus, any demolition applicant would not be subject to the 18 month delay provided in City Code.

- Ms. Lisby questioned the property's value.
- Mr. Austin replied the CCPA depicted an appraised value of approximately \$36,000. He mentioned the structure was located on three platted, buildable lots; however, he expressed uncertainty with regard to the structure's location within the context of same.
- Mr. Bower asked if the building was structurally sound.
- Mr. Austin replied he was not qualified to render an opinion regarding same, acknowledging a significant amount of exterior damage such as rotted woodwork, for example.
- Ms. Lisby asked if a cost comparison had been conducted with regard to restoration versus demolition.
- Mr. Austin replied he did not believe the property owner had conducted any such research. He commented on the potential for deterioration of any home when left unattended. He mentioned the home had been tented for termites fairly recently.
- Mr. Chalifoux clarified the home was currently in non-compliance with City Code, asking if fines were being assessed.
- Ms. Tubbs replied in the negative, stating Ms. Gerk had been very responsive to the initial notice from the Code Compliance Division. She acknowledged the situation's difficulty in that Ms. Gerk resided out of State, adding the death of her spouse had compounded the hardship.
- Mr. Chalifoux reiterated his uncertainty as to what staff was seeking from the Board.
- Ms. Tubbs explained staff hoped Board members could utilize their area contacts, adding perhaps assistance could be provided through community efforts.
- Mr. Chalifoux confirmed he would be in favor of seeing the home purchased and restored. He noted he was a State certified contractor and had personally performed significant restorations, adding he would visit the site and report his findings to Mr. Austin.
- Ms. Lisby asked if the home was concrete block.
- Mr. Austin replied it appeared to be fully wood frame.

Note: The meeting was adjourned following Staff Comments.

ADJOURNMENT

- Meeting Adjourned: 9:39 a.m.

John Chalifoux, Chairman

Mary Kelly, Recording Secretary